

Cornerstone Paving Program
Village of Hartville
Bid Opening Date: February 27, 2025
Bid Tabulation Summary

Project No. 242104

LIST OF BIDDERS

BIDDER

- 1 Northstar Asphalt, Inc.
7345 Sunset Strip NW
PO Box 2646
North Canton, OH 44720
Phone number: (330) 497-0936

- 2 Superior Paving & Materials, Inc.
5945 Whipple Ave. NW
North Canton, OH 44720-7613
Phone number: (330) 499-5849

- 3 The Shelly Company
8920 Canyon Falls Boulevard, Suite 120
Twinsburg, OH 44087
Phone number: (330) 405-4197

- 4 Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A
124 Darrow Road
Akron, OH 44305
Phone number: (330) 733-9101

- 5 Karvo Companies, Inc.
4524 Hudson Drive
Stow, OH 44224
Phone number: (330) 929-9616

- 6 Geauga Highway Company
9215 SR 303
Windham, OH 44288
Phone number: (440) 834-4850

- 7 Brennstuhl Construction, Inc.
500 South Main Street
Bellville, OH 44842
Phone number: (419) 631-8697

Cornerstone Paving Program
Village of Hartville
Bid Opening Date: February 27, 2025
Bid Tabulation Summary

Project No. 242104

LIST OF TOTALS

NOTE: Bidders Informal Totals appear if different than bid tab calculated total.

	<u>Name</u>	<u>Calculated Total</u>	<u>Bidder's Informal Totals</u>
1.	Northstar Asphalt, Inc.	\$551,981.00	
2.	Superior Paving & Materials, Inc.	\$566,962.50	
3.	The Shelly Company	\$585,797.00	
4.	Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$616,484.50	\$616,394.50
5.	Karvo Companies, Inc.	\$631,584.75	
6.	Geauga Highway Company	\$671,573.00	
7.	Brennstuhl Construction, Inc.	\$809,425.80	

Cornerstone Paving Program
 Village of Hartville
 Bid Opening Date: February 27, 2025
 Bid Tabulation Summary

Project No. 242104

LIST OF ALL ITEMS

NOTE: Bidders Informal unit price or item total appear if different than bid tab calculated price.

Bidders	Labor	Material	Calculated Unit Price	Bidder's Informal Unit Price	Calculated Line Item Total	Bidder's Informal Line Item Total
1. 1.00 LS OF (SPC) BONDS AND INSURANCES, AS PER PLAN						
Northstar Asphalt, Inc.	\$0.00	\$3,500.00	\$3,500.00		\$3,500.00	
Superior Paving & Materials, Inc.	\$3,500.00	\$0.00	\$3,500.00		\$3,500.00	
The Shelly Company	\$1.00	\$4,999.00	\$5,000.00		\$5,000.00	
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$3,000.00	\$3,000.00	\$6,000.00		\$6,000.00	
Karvo Companies, Inc.	\$0.00	\$2,500.00	\$2,500.00		\$2,500.00	
Geauga Highway Company	\$5,000.00	\$0.00	\$5,000.00		\$5,000.00	
Brennstuhl Construction, Inc.	\$0.00	\$9,000.00	\$9,000.00		\$9,000.00	
2. 2,533.00 SY OF (253) PAVEMENT REPAIR, AS PER PLAN						
Northstar Asphalt, Inc.	\$19.00	\$30.00	\$49.00		\$124,117.00	
Superior Paving & Materials, Inc.	\$20.00	\$22.00	\$42.00		\$106,386.00	
The Shelly Company	\$8.00	\$32.00	\$40.00		\$101,320.00	
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$14.46	\$25.54	\$40.00		\$101,320.00	
Karvo Companies, Inc.	\$23.75	\$23.75	\$47.50		\$120,317.50	
Geauga Highway Company	\$25.00	\$30.50	\$55.50		\$140,581.50	
Brennstuhl Construction, Inc.	\$76.58	\$31.67	\$108.25		\$274,197.25	
3. 21,885.00 SY OF (254) PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE, AS PER PLAN						
Northstar Asphalt, Inc.	\$2.00	\$0.00	\$2.00		\$43,770.00	
Superior Paving & Materials, Inc.	\$3.20	\$0.00	\$3.20		\$70,032.00	
The Shelly Company	\$0.66	\$2.64	\$3.30		\$72,220.50	
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$1.49	\$1.51	\$3.00		\$65,655.00	
Karvo Companies, Inc.	\$2.75	\$0.00	\$2.75		\$60,183.75	
Geauga Highway Company	\$2.30	\$0.00	\$2.30		\$50,335.50	
Brennstuhl Construction, Inc.	\$1.57	\$1.07	\$2.64		\$57,776.40	\$65,565.00
4. 876.00 GAL OF (407) NON-TRACKING TACK COAT						
Northstar Asphalt, Inc.	\$0.20	\$2.80	\$3.00		\$2,628.00	
Superior Paving & Materials, Inc.	\$0.50	\$3.00	\$3.50		\$3,066.00	
The Shelly Company	\$0.40	\$1.60	\$2.00		\$1,752.00	
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$0.25	\$3.00	\$3.25		\$2,847.00	
Karvo Companies, Inc.	\$1.75	\$1.00	\$2.75		\$2,409.00	
Geauga Highway Company	\$1.00	\$2.50	\$3.50		\$3,066.00	
Brennstuhl Construction, Inc.	\$0.00	\$4.40	\$4.40		\$3,854.40	

Cornerstone Paving Program
 Village of Hartville
 Bid Opening Date: February 27, 2025
 Bid Tabulation Summary

Project No. 242104

LIST OF ALL ITEMS

NOTE: Bidders Informal unit price or item total appear if different than bid tab calculated price.

<u>Bidders</u>	<u>Labor</u>	<u>Material</u>	<u>Calculated Unit Price</u>	<u>Bidder's Informal Unit Price</u>	<u>Calculated Line Item Total</u>	<u>Bidder's Informal Line Item Total</u>
5. 760.00 CY OF (441) ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), AS PER PLAN						
Northstar Asphalt, Inc.	\$22.00	\$150.00	\$172.00		\$130,720.00	
Superior Paving & Materials, Inc.	\$72.00	\$100.00	\$172.00		\$130,720.00	
The Shelly Company	\$37.20	\$148.80	\$186.00		\$141,360.00	
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$29.14	\$175.86	\$205.00		\$155,800.00	
Karvo Companies, Inc.	\$95.00	\$95.00	\$190.00		\$144,400.00	
Geauga Highway Company	\$100.00	\$92.00	\$192.00		\$145,920.00	
Brennstuhl Construction, Inc.	\$67.59	\$152.90	\$220.49		\$167,572.40	
6. 1,064.00 CY OF (441) ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 2, (448), AS PER PLAN						
Northstar Asphalt, Inc.	\$14.00	\$120.00	\$134.00		\$142,576.00	
Superior Paving & Materials, Inc.	\$70.00	\$84.00	\$154.00		\$163,856.00	
The Shelly Company	\$30.60	\$122.40	\$153.00		\$162,792.00	
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$24.72	\$180.28	\$205.00		\$218,120.00	
Karvo Companies, Inc.	\$81.50	\$81.50	\$163.00		\$173,432.00	
Geauga Highway Company	\$100.00	\$75.00	\$175.00		\$186,200.00	
Brennstuhl Construction, Inc.	\$66.29	\$135.86	\$202.15		\$215,087.60	
7. 25.00 FT OF (609) CONCRETE CURB AND GUTTER, AS PER PLAN						
Northstar Asphalt, Inc.	\$120.00	\$20.00	\$140.00		\$3,500.00	
Superior Paving & Materials, Inc.	\$70.00	\$70.00	\$140.00		\$3,500.00	
The Shelly Company	\$12.00	\$48.00	\$60.00		\$1,500.00	
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$51.30	\$23.70	\$75.00		\$1,875.00	
Karvo Companies, Inc.	\$47.50	\$47.50	\$95.00		\$2,375.00	
Geauga Highway Company	\$30.00	\$35.00	\$65.00		\$1,625.00	
Brennstuhl Construction, Inc.	\$27.13	\$0.00	\$27.13		\$678.25	
8. 2.00 EACH OF (611) CATCH BASIN ADJUSTED TO GRADE						
Northstar Asphalt, Inc.	\$500.00	\$1,320.00	\$1,820.00		\$3,640.00	
Superior Paving & Materials, Inc.	\$650.00	\$650.00	\$1,300.00		\$2,600.00	
The Shelly Company	\$250.00	\$1,000.00	\$1,250.00		\$2,500.00	
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$826.31	\$173.69	\$1,000.00		\$2,000.00	
Karvo Companies, Inc.	\$700.00	\$500.00	\$1,200.00		\$2,400.00	
Geauga Highway Company	\$500.00	\$600.00	\$1,100.00		\$2,200.00	
Brennstuhl Construction, Inc.	\$150.70	\$0.00	\$150.70		\$301.40	

Cornerstone Paving Program
 Village of Hartville
 Bid Opening Date: February 27, 2025
 Bid Tabulation Summary

Project No. 242104

LIST OF ALL ITEMS

NOTE: Bidders Informal unit price or item total appear if different than bid tab calculated price.

Bidders	Labor	Material	Calculated Unit Price	Bidder's Informal Unit Price	Calculated Line Item Total	Bidder's Informal Line Item Total
9. 8.00 EACH OF (611) MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE, AS PER PLAN						
Northstar Asphalt, Inc.	\$350.00	\$1,230.00	\$1,580.00		\$12,640.00	
Superior Paving & Materials, Inc.	\$200.00	\$200.00	\$400.00		\$3,200.00	
The Shelly Company	\$196.00	\$784.00	\$980.00		\$7,840.00	
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$370.28	\$129.72	\$500.00		\$4,000.00	
Karvo Companies, Inc.	\$1,000.00	\$700.00	\$1,700.00		\$13,600.00	
Geauga Highway Company	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$1,000.00		\$8,000.00	
Brennstuhl Construction, Inc.	\$150.70	\$0.00	\$150.70		\$1,205.60	
10. 1,300.00 LB OF (611) SPECIAL - MISCELLANEOUS METAL						
Northstar Asphalt, Inc.	\$0.50	\$1.00	\$1.50		\$1,950.00	
Superior Paving & Materials, Inc.	\$0.85	\$1.00	\$1.85		\$2,405.00	
The Shelly Company	\$0.40	\$1.60	\$2.00		\$2,600.00	
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$0.85	\$1.00	\$1.85		\$2,405.00	
Karvo Companies, Inc.	\$0.85	\$1.00	\$1.85		\$2,405.00	
Geauga Highway Company	\$1.00	\$0.75	\$1.75		\$2,275.00	
Brennstuhl Construction, Inc.	\$0.00	\$2.20	\$2.20		\$2,860.00	
11. 1.00 LS OF (614) MAINTAINING TRAFFIC, AS PER PLAN						
Northstar Asphalt, Inc.	\$19,500.00	\$500.00	\$20,000.00		\$20,000.00	
Superior Paving & Materials, Inc.	\$15,925.00	\$0.00	\$15,925.00		\$15,925.00	
The Shelly Company	\$4,000.00	\$16,000.00	\$20,000.00		\$20,000.00	
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$4,104.12	\$895.88	\$5,000.00		\$5,000.00	
Karvo Companies, Inc.	\$19,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$29,000.00		\$29,000.00	
Geauga Highway Company	\$62,500.00	\$0.00	\$62,500.00		\$62,500.00	
Brennstuhl Construction, Inc.	\$22,572.00	\$0.00	\$22,572.00		\$22,572.00	
12. 1.00 LS OF (624) MOBILIZATION						
Northstar Asphalt, Inc.	\$10,000.00	\$0.00	\$10,000.00		\$10,000.00	
Superior Paving & Materials, Inc.	\$11,500.00	\$0.00	\$11,500.00		\$11,500.00	
The Shelly Company	\$1,600.00	\$6,400.00	\$8,000.00		\$8,000.00	
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$1,000.00		\$1,000.00	
Karvo Companies, Inc.	\$9,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$19,000.00		\$19,000.00	
Geauga Highway Company	\$4,000.00	\$0.00	\$4,000.00		\$4,000.00	
Brennstuhl Construction, Inc.	\$0.00	\$5,500.00	\$5,500.00		\$5,500.00	

Cornerstone Paving Program
 Village of Hartville
 Bid Opening Date: February 27, 2025
 Bid Tabulation Summary

Project No. 242104

LIST OF ALL ITEMS

NOTE: Bidders Informal unit price or item total appear if different than bid tab calculated price.

Bidders	Labor	Material	Calculated Unit Price	Bidder's Informal Unit Price	Calculated Line Item Total	Bidder's Informal Line Item Total
13. 1.00 EACH OF (638) VALVE BOX						
Northstar Asphalt, Inc.	\$1,000.00	\$500.00	\$1,500.00		\$1,500.00	
Superior Paving & Materials, Inc.	\$0.00	\$1,200.00	\$1,200.00		\$1,200.00	
The Shelly Company	\$160.00	\$640.00	\$800.00		\$800.00	
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$158.47	\$191.53	\$350.00		\$350.00	
Karvo Companies, Inc.	\$325.00	\$325.00	\$650.00		\$650.00	
Geauga Highway Company	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$1,000.00		\$1,000.00	
Brennstuhl Construction, Inc.	\$75.35	\$0.00	\$75.35		\$75.35	
14. 16.00 EACH OF (638) VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE						
Northstar Asphalt, Inc.	\$60.00	\$100.00	\$160.00		\$2,560.00	
Superior Paving & Materials, Inc.	\$17.50	\$35.00	\$35.00		\$560.00	
The Shelly Company	\$120.00	\$480.00	\$600.00		\$9,600.00	
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$54.32	\$45.68	\$100.00		\$1,600.00	
Karvo Companies, Inc.	\$325.00	\$325.00	\$650.00		\$10,400.00	
Geauga Highway Company	\$300.00	\$350.00	\$650.00		\$10,400.00	
Brennstuhl Construction, Inc.	\$75.35	\$0.00	\$75.35		\$1,205.60	
15. 82.00 FT OF (644) STOP LINE						
Northstar Asphalt, Inc.	\$10.00	\$5.00	\$15.00		\$1,230.00	
Superior Paving & Materials, Inc.	\$4.50	\$8.00	\$12.50		\$1,025.00	
The Shelly Company	\$2.50	\$10.00	\$12.50		\$1,025.00	
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$6.25	\$6.25	\$12.50		\$1,025.00	
Karvo Companies, Inc.	\$6.25	\$6.25	\$12.50		\$1,025.00	
Geauga Highway Company	\$5.00	\$5.00	\$10.00		\$820.00	
Brennstuhl Construction, Inc.	\$0.00	\$4.40	\$4.40		\$360.80	
16. 65.00 FT OF (644) CROSSWALK LINE						
Northstar Asphalt, Inc.	\$4.00	\$6.00	\$10.00		\$650.00	
Superior Paving & Materials, Inc.	\$2.50	\$5.00	\$7.50		\$487.50	
The Shelly Company	\$1.50	\$6.00	\$7.50		\$487.50	
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$3.75	\$3.75	\$7.50		\$487.50	
Karvo Companies, Inc.	\$3.75	\$3.75	\$7.50		\$487.50	
Geauga Highway Company	\$5.00	\$5.00	\$10.00		\$650.00	
Brennstuhl Construction, Inc.	\$0.00	\$2.75	\$2.75		\$178.75	

Cornerstone Paving Program
 Village of Hartville
 Bid Opening Date: February 27, 2025
 Bid Tabulation Summary

Project No. 242104

LIST OF ALL ITEMS

NOTE: Bidders Informal unit price or item total appear if different than bid tab calculated price.

Bidders	<u>Labor</u>	<u>Material</u>	<u>Calculated</u>		<u>Bidder's</u>	
			<u>Unit Price</u>	<u>Unit Price</u>	<u>Informal</u>	<u>Total</u>
17. 1.00 LS OF (SPC) CONTINGENCY/DISCRETIONARY ALLOWANCE						
Northstar Asphalt, Inc.	\$0.00	\$47,000.00	\$47,000.00	\$47,000.00		
Superior Paving & Materials, Inc.	\$0.00	\$47,000.00	\$47,000.00	\$47,000.00		
The Shelly Company	\$0.00	\$47,000.00	\$47,000.00	\$47,000.00		
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$0.00	\$47,000.00	\$47,000.00	\$47,000.00		
Karvo Companies, Inc.	\$0.00	\$47,000.00	\$47,000.00	\$47,000.00		
Geauga Highway Company	\$0.00	\$47,000.00	\$47,000.00	\$47,000.00		
Brennstuhl Construction, Inc.	\$0.00	\$47,000.00	\$47,000.00	\$47,000.00		